

Appendix A. Considered but Rejected Alternatives and Sub-alternatives

Endorsement Transferability Between Gear Types (Action 3)

Alternative 7. Endorsements can be changed from one gear type to another.

Rationale for elimination: At their September 2010 meeting, the South Atlantic Fishery Management Council (South Atlantic Council) rejected this alternative because if fishermen were allowed to transfer endorsements between gear types (hook-and-line and longline), there would not be a need for a separate endorsement program for each gear types. Furthermore, the South Atlantic Council concluded that allowing endorsements to be transferred from hook-and-line to a more efficient gear (longline) would alleviate derby conditions and rate at which the quota is met. Furthermore, this scenario would not increase the chance of fishermen from Florida to target golden tilefish with hook-and-line gear in the fall, which is one of the objectives of Amendment 18B to the Fishery Management Plan for the Snapper Grouper Fishery of the South Atlantic Region (Amendment 18B).

Type of Endorsement (Action 1)

Sub-alternative 2c. Individuals that meet the qualifying criteria for both hook and line and longline endorsements only receive a hook and line endorsement.

Sub-alternative 2d. Individuals that meet the qualifying criteria for both hook and line and longline endorsements only receive a longline endorsement.

Rationale for elimination: At their September 2011 meeting, the South Atlantic Council indicated they did not want to dictate which type of endorsement an individual should receive if he/she qualified for both. The South Atlantic Council concluded that if an individual qualified for both endorsements, they should receive both. It was regarded as too prescriptive and unnecessary to make someone choose which endorsement they should receive.

Establish Initial Eligibility Requirements for a Golden Tilefish Hook and Line Endorsement (Action 2)

Rationale for Elimination: With the increase in the golden tilefish annual catch limit (ACL) proposed through Regulatory Amendment 12 to the Fishery Management Plan for the Snapper Grouper Fishery of the South Atlantic Region (under review by the Secretary of Commerce) along with an allocation of 25% of the commercial ACL to the hook-and-line sector proposed in Amendment 18B, the South Atlantic Council indicated at their March 2012 meeting that there no longer was a need for a hook-and-line endorsement. The increase in the ACL, if approved by the Secretary of Commerce, would be well above recent landings (and takes into account recent overages). The hook-and-line sector has taken about 12% of the landings since 2004. The South Atlantic Council's preferred allocation between the sectors is 75% and 25% for longline and hook-and-line, respectively. With the upcoming increase in the ACL (if approved by the Secretary of Commerce) and the proposed increase in the hook-and-line allocation in Amendment 18B, establishment of hook-and-line endorsements may limit the use of the resource unnecessarily during a time when regulations on other snapper grouper species are very restrictive. This is contradictory to the South Atlantic Council's stated purpose and need

for this amendment. The South Atlantic Council chose instead to focus on establishment of longline endorsements only, and defer consideration of hook and line endorsements until a future time.

Eligibility for Hook and Line Endorsement (Action 2)

Sub-alternative 2b. To receive a golden tilefish hook and line endorsement, the individual must have a harvest level of 500 pounds gw (with hook and line gear) when the individual's best three of five years from 2001-2005 are aggregated. (Sub-alternative devised by the GT LAP WG)

Sub-alternative 2c. To receive a golden tilefish hook and line endorsement, the individual must have a harvest level of 500 pounds gw (with hook and line gear) when the individual's landings from 2001-2005 are averaged.

Sub-alternative 2d. To receive a golden tilefish hook and line endorsement, the individual must have a harvest level of 500 pounds gw (with hook and line gear) when the individual's landings from 1999-2008 are averaged.

Sub-alternative 2e. To receive a golden tilefish hook and line endorsement, the individual must have a harvest level of 1,000 pounds gw (with hook and line gear) when the individual's landings from 1999-2008 are averaged.

Sub-alternative 2f. To receive a golden tilefish hook and line endorsement, the individual must have a harvest level of 1,000 pounds gw (with hook and line gear) when the best 3 of 5 yrs 2001-05 are aggregated and at least 1 lb was landed in 2008.

Sub-alternative 2h. To receive a golden tilefish hook and line endorsement, the individual must have a harvest level of 500 pounds gw (with hook and line gear) when the best 3 of 5 yrs 2001-05 are aggregated and at least 1 lb was landed in 2008.

Sub-alternative 2j. To receive a golden tilefish hook and line endorsement, the individual must have a harvest level of 500 pounds gw (with hook and line gear) when the best 3 of 5 yrs 2001-05 are averaged and at least 1 lb was landed in 2008.

Sub-alternative 2k. To receive a golden tilefish hook and line endorsement, the individual must have a harvest level of 500 pounds gw (with hook and line gear) when the best 3 of 5 yrs 2001-05 are averaged and at least 1 lb was landed in 2007 or 2008.

Rationale for elimination: At their September 2011 meeting, the South Atlantic Council indicated there were too many alternatives for this action and the specified eligibility periods were no longer appropriate since they did not capture enough current participation in the golden tilefish component of the snapper grouper fishery.

Eligibility for Longline Endorsement (Action 3)

Sub-alternative 2f. To receive a golden tilefish longline endorsement, the individual must have an average of 10,000 pounds gw golden tilefish caught (with longline gear) between 2007 and 2010.

Sub-alternative 2g. To receive a golden tilefish longline endorsement, the individual must have an average of 20,000 pounds gw golden tilefish caught (with longline gear) between 2007 and 2010.

Sub-alternative 2h. To receive a golden tilefish longline endorsement, the individual must have an average of 30,000 pounds gw golden tilefish caught (with longline gear) between 2007 and 2010.

Rationale for elimination: The sub-alternatives above were added for analysis at the September 2011 South Atlantic Council meeting. However, a new sub-alternative was proposed at the December 2011 meeting and selected as the preferred. The sub-alternative (**Sub-alternative 2f**) captured what the above sub-alternatives were intended to address. Hence, the South Atlantic Council voted to move these to the considered but rejected Appendix A.

Endorsement Transferability (Action 6)

Under **Alternative 2** (longline golden tilefish endorsements can be transferred between any two individuals or entities that hold valid unlimited Federal commercial snapper grouper permits and fish with longline gear) the sub-alternatives below were removed from consideration:

Sub-alternative 2c. Transferability not allowed during the first 3 years of the program.

Sub-alternative 2d. Transferability not allowed during the first 5 years of the program.

Under **Alternative 3** (hook and line golden tilefish endorsements can be transferred between any two individuals or entities that hold valid unlimited Federal commercial snapper grouper permits and fish with hook and line gear) the sub-alternatives below were removed from consideration:

Sub-alternative 3c. Transferability not allowed during the first 3 years of the program.

Sub-alternative 3d. Transferability not allowed during the first 5 years of the program.

Under **Alternative 4** (hook and line and longline golden tilefish endorsements can be transferred between any two individuals or entities that hold valid unlimited Federal commercial snapper grouper permits, regardless of the gear endorsement category) the sub-alternatives below were removed from consideration:

Sub-alternative 4c. Transferability not allowed during the first 3 years of the program.

Sub-alternative 4d. Transferability not allowed during the first 5 years of the program.

Rationale for elimination: The South Atlantic Council removed the above sub-alternatives at their December 2011 meeting because they concluded 3 or 5 years was too long a time period to wait before endorsements could be transferred. Thus, the above sub-alternatives were deemed unnecessary.

Alternative 3. A valid or expired hook and line golden tilefish endorsement can be transferred between any two individuals or entities that hold, or simultaneously obtain, a valid or renewable unlimited Federal commercial snapper grouper permit.

Sub-alternative 3a. Transferability allowed upon program implementation.

Sub-alternative 3b. Transferability not allowed during the first 2 years of the program.

Alternative 4. A valid or expired hook and line and longline golden tilefish endorsement can be transferred between any two individuals or entities that hold, or simultaneously obtain, a valid or renewable unlimited Federal commercial snapper grouper permit, regardless of the gear endorsement category.

Sub-alternative 4a. Transferability allowed upon program implementation.

Sub-alternative 4b. Transferability not allowed during the first 2 years of the program.

Rationale for Elimination: At their March 2012 meeting, the South Atlantic Council determined that there no longer was a need for a hook-and-line endorsement because of the proposed increase in the ACL through Regulatory Amendment 12 as well as the proposed allocation of the commercial ACL for the hook and line sector in Amendment 18B. Hence, the alternatives and sub-alternatives above, and formerly included in Action 6, were determined by the South Atlantic Council to be unnecessary.

Trip Limits for Fishermen Who Receive Hook and Line Endorsement (Action 10)

Alternative 3. Establish trip limits of 400 pounds for fishermen who receive hook and line endorsement in the golden tilefish fishery.

Alternative 4. Establish trip limits of 500 pounds for fishermen who receive hook and line endorsement in the golden tilefish fishery.

Rationale for elimination: These alternatives were mistakenly taken out of the document prior to public hearings. However, the South Atlantic Council subsequently chose not to consider an endorsement for the hook-and-line sector at their March 2012 meeting. Therefore, all alternatives pertaining to a hook-and-line endorsement were determined by the South Atlantic Council to be unnecessary.

Action 10. Establish Trip Limits for Fishermen Who Receive a Golden Tilefish Hook and Line Endorsement

Rationale for Elimination: At their March 2012 meeting, the South Atlantic Council determined that there no longer was a need for a hook-and-line endorsement because of the proposed increase in the ACL through Regulatory Amendment 12 as well as the proposed allocation of the commercial ACL for the hook-and-line sector in Amendment 18B. Therefore, all alternatives pertaining to a hook-and-line endorsement were determined by the South Atlantic Council to be unnecessary.

Annual Catch Limit and Accountability Measures (Actions 11 and 12)

Action 11. Revise the Annual Catch Limit (ACL) and Optimum Yield (OY) for Golden Tilefish

Action 12. Revise Accountability Measures (AMs) for Golden Tilefish

Rationale for Elimination: These actions were removed from consideration in Amendment 18B and moved to Regulatory Amendment 12 (under review by the Secretary of Commerce).